

**Sustainability Review of  
Carlisle Economic  
Development Strategy**

**URS Corporation**

November 2007  
Draft Report

Issue No 1  
49315941

**Project Title:** Sustainability Review of Carlisle Economic Development Strategy  
**Report Title:** Sustainability Review of Carlisle Economic Development Strategy  
**Project No:** 49315941  
**Report Ref:**  
**Status:** Draft Report  
**Client Contact Name:** Don Taylor  
**Client Company Name:** Carlisle City Council  
**Issued By:** URS Wimbledon Office  
 St George's House, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
 5 St George's Road  
 Wimbledon, London  
 SW19 4 DR

**Document Production / Approval Record**

Issue No: 3	Name	Signature	Date	Position
Prepared by	Brendan Tapley			Project Manager
Reviewed by	Claire Lawless			Project Director
Checked and Approved by	Rory Brooke			Principal

**Document Revision Record**

Issue No	Date	Details of Revisions
1	22/11/07	Original issue – Draft Report
2		Final Report

**LIMITATION**

URS Corporation Limited (URS) has prepared this Report for the sole use of London Development Agency in accordance with the Agreement under which our services were performed. No other warranty, expressed or implied, is made as to the professional advice included in this Report or any other services provided by us. This Report may not be relied upon by any other party without the prior and express written agreement of URS. Unless otherwise stated in this Report, the assessments made assume that the sites and facilities will continue to be used for their current purpose without significant change. The conclusions and recommendations contained in this Report are based upon information provided by others and upon the assumption that all relevant information has been provided by those parties from whom it has been requested. Information obtained from third parties has not been independently verified by URS, unless otherwise stated in the Report.

**COPYRIGHT**

© This Report is the copyright of URS Corporation Limited. Any unauthorised reproduction or usage by any person other than the addressee is strictly prohibited.

## CONTENTS

Section	Page No
<b>1. INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Approach .....	1
1.2. Structure of Report .....	1
<b>2. REVIEW PROCESS.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>3. REVIEW FINDINGS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
3.1. Place Theme .....	3
3.2. People Theme .....	3
3.3. Connections Theme .....	4
<b>4. RECOMMENDED ACTIONS .....</b>	<b>1</b>
4.1. Place theme .....	1
4.2. People theme .....	1
4.3. Connections theme .....	2
4.4. Cross Cutting Actions.....	2
<b>5. SUGGESTED INDICATORS .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>6. APPENDICES - FINDINGS OF THE SUSTAINABILITY REVIEW .....</b>	<b>6</b>
6.1. Place .....	6
6.2. People .....	8
6.3. Connections .....	10

## **ABBREVIATIONS**

## 1. INTRODUCTION

URS Corporation Ltd were appointed by Carlisle City Council to provide a sustainability audit of Carlisle's local economic development strategy. The purpose of this assignment was to identify the sustainability impacts of the strategy by reviewing key projects. Based on a review of strategic objectives and key projects URS were asked to recommend actions to mitigate negative sustainability impacts and to suggest appropriate indicators against which to measure the sustainability of the strategy.

### 1.1. Approach

There are four requirements of the brief provided to URS:

1. Provide a statement which explains the review process for the sustainability audit;
2. Use the agreed review process to audit the economic development strategy;
3. Provide a two page narrative setting out key findings from the sustainability audit; and
4. Develop an action plan setting out recommendations from the review, highlighting actions to mitigate negative effects and maximise the beneficial effects – with suggestions on appropriate indicators to monitor effects.

### 1.2. Structure of Report

The remainder of this report is structured as follows:

- **Section 2:** Sets out the review process.
- **Section 3:** Sets out key findings from the review process, with detailed assessments for each theme provided in appendices.
- **Section 4:** Sets out our recommended actions.
- **Section 5:** Includes a series of suggested indicators against each theme.

## 2. REVIEW PROCESS

We first identified a high-level set of sustainability objectives to underpin our assessment, in the form of the Governments four aims for sustainable development:

- Social progress which recognises the needs of everyone;
- Effective protection of the environment;
- The prudent use of natural resources; and
- The maintenance of high and stable levels of economic growth and employment.

These objectives underpin the UK Sustainable Development Strategy and Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Development. The objectives also underpin the 85 indicators to measure progress on social, economic and environmental issues that were published in the report titled 'Measuring Quality of Life in Cumbria' by the County Council's Sustainability Unit in 2002.

PPS1 sets out how the objectives can be integrated:

*'These aims should be pursued in an integrated way through a sustainable, innovative and productive economy that delivers high levels of employment, and a just society that promotes social inclusion, sustainable communities and personal well being, in ways that protect and enhance the physical environment and optimise resource and energy use.'*

Having established the key sustainability objectives that we would use, we next conducted a review of available sustainability appraisal and criteria frameworks that had already been applied within Cumbria, with the aim to identify criteria that could be applied to Carlisle. Documents reviewed included the Sustainability Appraisal/Compatibility Test of Sustainable Cumbria - A Strategy for Growth and Progress for Cumbria 2004-2024; and the Sustainability Appraisal of the West Cumbria Community Strategy conducted in 2004. The latter constitutes a complete sustainability appraisal with well-developed criteria that are based upon the government's four sustainability objectives. On this basis we decided to use these criteria in our sustainability review of Carlisle Economic Development Strategy. The criteria are listed in Table 1.

We then screened the Economic Development Strategy against the sustainability criteria, focussing on the main projects for each theme of the Strategy. When we identified that an action had a potential effect against the sustainability criteria (for example, an action that could potentially lead to increased greenhouse emissions) we would make a note of whether the effect was positive or negative. The results of this assessment are documented in section three of this report. Having identified the potential effects we then developed recommendations to

mitigate adverse effects or maximise positive effects, and finally developed indicators to monitor the effects.

**Table 1: Sustainability Criteria Applied to Carlisle Economic Development Strategy**

Sustainability Objective	Sustainability Criteria
Social progress	SP1 Access to basic goods, facilities and services
	SP2 Affordable, good quality, resource efficient housing
	SP3 Reduce crime, disorder and the fear of crime
	SP4 Improve health and reduce health inequalities
	SP5 Involve all stakeholders in decision-making
	SP6 Support diversity, improve equity and equality of opportunity
	SP7 Improve access to recreational activities
Protection of the environment	PE1 Protect and enhance biodiversity
	PE2 Protect and improve the quality of inland and coastal waters
	PE3 Improve local air quality
	PE4 Improve land and soil quality
	PE5 Reduce greenhouse gas emissions
Prudent use of natural resources	NR1 Reduce waste and re-use or recycle residual waste
	NR2 Minimise energy use and manage existing natural resources
	NR3 Protect places, landscapes and buildings of historical value
Economic growth	EGE1 Broaden and strengthen the local economic base
	EGE2 Increase employment opportunities and improve the quality of employment
	EGE3 Help develop and support a healthy labour market
	EGE4 Maintain and support existing businesses

### **3. REVIEW FINDINGS**

In this section we highlight the positive and negative effects arising from our assessment of the Strategy. Further details of the sustainability assessment for each theme are listed in the Appendices.

#### **3.1. Place Theme**

##### **Positive Effects**

The projects and proposals for the Places theme provide a number of positive potential sustainability effects, particularly with regards to strengthening and growing the economy. These include:

- Increased employment opportunities
- Provision of affordable, good quality, resource efficient housing to meet future demand
- Increased tourism opportunities, industry diversification and economic activity and
- Enhanced capacity to attract and retain workers
- Increased accessibility to services in rural areas

##### **Negative Effects**

Negative potential sustainability effects include:

- Increased emissions from property developments

#### **3.2. People Theme**

##### **Positive Effects**

The projects and proposals for the people theme provide a range of positive effects including:

- Improved capability for deprived members of society to access employment opportunities
- Improved capability for youth to access employment opportunities
- Reduced potential for crime amongst youth and the deprived
- Strengthened supply of local labour
- More focussed economic growth through better matching of labour supply with labour demand
- Protection of the environment through increased environmental management by businesses

- Increased business and employment opportunities from increased knowledge transfer and innovation

There were no negative effects found to stand out. However, some of the positive effects could be improved. These are listed in section 4 of this report.

### **3.3. Connections Theme**

#### **Positive Effects**

Projects and proposals under the Connections theme feature a number of positive potential sustainability impacts. These include:

- Enhanced economic activity through the attraction of tourists and business investors
- Reduce traffic congestion, increased safety and accessibility to and from Carlisle
- Shift to sustainable travel modes (rail, bus, cycle and walking) with less car dependency and carbon emissions
- More environmentally friendly businesses that emit less carbon emissions

#### **Negative Effects**

Negative potential sustainability impacts include:

- Increased carbon emissions from an increased number of flights, once the airport capacity is expanded
- Increased dependence on cars arising from expansions to highways

## 4. RECOMMENDED ACTIONS

This section presents a series of recommendations to mitigate potential adverse effects, maximise potential beneficial effects and suggests indicators that can be used to monitor such effects.

### 4.1. Place theme

- Make requirements for leading voluntary sustainable design and construction principles to be applied to the Council's property developments, using:
  - The BRE Environmental Assessment Method (BREEAM)
  - The 'Merton Council rule' which stipulates that new buildings must obtain 10% of their energy supply from renewable energy
- In deciding the location of the theatre/arts centre, consider access to, and provision of, sustainable modes of transport
- Incorporate sustainable modes of transport into the functional improvements that will support Longtown's and Brampton's roles as rural service centres
- Form a tourism association consisting of tourism operators to coordinate tourism activities in Carlisle

### 4.2. People theme

- Integrate the 'initiatives to support environmental management' with the environmentally friendly business advice initiatives listed under the Connections theme of the Economic Development Strategy.
- Extend the initiatives into a Sustainable Business Program. This will raise environmental awareness in the community through:
  - An audit being conducted on a number of business (at least 15) to identify how their electricity use, materials consumption (e.g. water and paper), and waste can be minimised
  - A follow up audit conducted 6 months later to measure the resource savings (including cost savings) achieved
  - The results would be promoted amongst local media to raise the profile of both the Council, and local businesses, as environmental leaders in the community

### 4.3. Connections theme

- Develop a strategy that will work to abate the increased carbon emissions created by increased traffic at Carlisle Airport. This would involve quantifying baseline emissions and the projected increase in emissions, setting emissions reduction targets, and then developing and implementing initiatives to achieve the targets. An example of an abatement initiative that might come out of such a strategy is participation in a carbon-offsetting program (such as that offered by the Voluntary Carbon Standard developed by the International Emission Trading Association)
- Assess how improvements to the A69 and M6 could be used to increase take up of public transport and reduce car dependence. For example the road works could be complemented by enhanced provision of bus lanes/services and facilities
- Ensure that the Parking Strategy is integrated with and supports the Economic Development Strategy actions related to increased use of sustainable forms of transport and reduced greenhouse emissions. Consideration should be given to parking restraint measure such as limited parking combined with provision of public transport access routes, to encourage travel mode shift, and to reduce car use and greenhouse emissions
- Extend the scope of environmental advice given to businesses to include advice on minimising waste, and how to implement a sustainable travel plan for employees
- Hold 'sustainable business awards' to recognise businesses that have made outstanding achievement in reducing for example, their carbon emissions and waste
- Screen planning applications using sustainable transport criteria (such as Smart Growth criteria) to better integrate transport planning into developments

### 4.4. Cross Cutting Actions

In addition to key actions highlighted for each theme, we suggest a series of cross cutting actions that are relevant to all suggested actions:

- Clarify roles and responsibilities for delivering recommended actions with key stakeholders
- Ensure sustainability actions are integrated with the wider delivery of the strategy, including ensuring sustainability measures are considered against all projects contributing to the strategy

- Develop a series of indicators that will be available over the duration of the strategy, relevant to the local area, and within the remit and resources dedicated to delivering the strategy. Agree key indicators with partners and responsibility for collecting each indicator

## 5. SUGGESTED INDICATORS

We suggest a series of indicators by theme in the table below. Where possible we have tried to draw on existing appropriate indicators relevant to the impacts identified, and which are already being collected. In many cases we have suggested Cumbria wide data. Data collected at the local level would be a more appropriate indicator – although we have not identified evidence that these indicators are collected and may require new primary research or exploring existing data to see if it can be disaggregated to the local level. We comment on each below:

Measure	Potential source
<b>Theme 1: Place</b>	
<i>Environmental performance of council buildings:</i>	
BREAAM ratings for new buildings	Carlisle City Council
Number of new buildings that are partly or wholly funded by council which use renewable energy	Carlisle City Council
% of energy supplied by renewables for new council buildings	Carlisle City Council
<i>Employment:</i>	
Change in employment rate	Annual Business Inquiry
Change in number and % of skilled workers	Annual Business Inquiry/ Census Data
<i>Growth in the tourism industry:</i>	
Relative £ earned by tourism operators per quarter	UK Tourism/ local tourism operators
The change in the number of people employed in tourism per quarter	UK Tourism/ local tourism operators
<b>Theme 2: People</b>	
<i>Resource savings for businesses participating in the Sustainable Business Program:</i>	
Cost savings	Participating businesses

Energy savings	Participating businesses
Amount of waste reduced/recycled	Participating businesses
<b>Theme 3: Connections</b>	
<i>Quantity of Carbon Emissions:</i>	
From Carlisle Airport	New research required (airplane fuel consumption and equivalent emissions)
Businesses participating in Carbon emissions benchmarking programme	New research required
<i>Take up of sustainable forms of transport:</i>	
No. Cycling trips at representative locations	Cumbria County Council Traffic Data Monitoring - Traffic Counters and Sustrans Cycleway Data
No. Buss passenger journeys	Cumbria County Council monitoring of operators data
Numbers of Light rail passengers	Cumbria County Council Local Transport Plan (2001 – 06)
No. employees with Effective travel plans	Cumbria County Council survey of major employers
% users satisfied with local bus services	Department for Transport triennial user Satisfaction Survey
<i>Road Safety:</i>	
No. people killed or seriously injured on roads	Cumbria Road Safety Partnership
<i>Traffic Congestion:</i>	
Journey time reliability	Cumbria County Council survey

## 6. APPENDICES

### 6.1. Place

Project/Proposal	Potential Effects (+ positive, X negative)
6.4.1 Complete an Employment Land Review	+ Increased employment opportunities
6.4.1 Implementation of 1 industrial estate regeneration project resulting in provision of new/refurbished premises	+ Provision of affordable, good quality, resource efficient housing
6.4.1 Evaluation of opportunities for bringing brownfield sites to the market and implementation of 1 project	+ Increased employment opportunities
6.4.1 Evaluate growth scenarios and agree future housing allocations	+ Provision of affordable, good quality, resource efficient housing to meet future demand
6.7.1 Public realm improvement projects	+ Attraction of more tourists and employees to Carlisle, leading to increased and more diversified economic activity.
6.7.1 Redevelopment of Woolworths Block for mixed use comprising retail and commercial offices	X Potential increased emissions from new buildings in this, and other planned developments (the built environment accounts for around 47 percent of UK CO <sup>2</sup> emissions) <sup>1</sup>
Table PL2 and 6.5.2 Improve the public realm and develop the potential of the historic quarter e.g. through the planned  Castle Street improvements (seen as a benchmark for future public realm projects in the historic quarter)	+ Improving the public realm will enhance places of historic value.
6.7.1 Address need for a City Centre hotel and conference facilities	+ Increased tourism, business investment and employment opportunities

<sup>1</sup> Briefing Paper by Friends of the Earth Scotland and Association for the Conservation of Energy Policy (2004)

6.7.1 Agreement on location of theatre/arts centre	+ Increased night time economic activity from new theatre/arts centre
<p>+6.10.2 Pilot project to improve access to services in Longtown and Brampton implemented</p> <p>+6.10.2 Functional improvements to support Longtown's and Brampton's roles as rural service centres identified and one project in each centre implemented [car parking etc]</p>	+ Improved accessibility to key services
+Table PL3 Improved pedestrian and cycling facilities to improve access to jobs in the City Centre and North Carlisle	+ Improved accessibility to sustainable modes of transport and jobs
+6.10.2 Tourism & tourism business support programmes in place linked to expansion of Hadrian's Wall visitor offer	+ Increased tourism and employment opportunities
+6.12 Information and marketing strategy in place to promote the Carlisle offer in terms of investment, business and lifestyle opportunities	+ Increased tourism opportunities

## 6.2. People

<b>Project/Proposal</b>	<b>Potential Effects</b> <b>(+ positive, X negative)</b>
7.4.1 Community based projects to address aspirations and self confidence enabling transition to employment specifically within priority groups	+ Improved capability for deprived members of society to access employment opportunities, improved wellbeing of members of society, and a strengthened supply of local labour
7.4.1 'Young People' based projects across all sectors	+ Improved capability for youth to access employment opportunities, reduced youth crime and disorder, and development of a healthy labour market
7.4.1. Bespoke recruitment and training projects to maximise on economic growth through inward investment	+ Development of a healthy labour market and increased employment
7.4.1. Develop a delivery framework to enable local communities to take advantage of the employment opportunities arising from Carlisle Renaissance	+ Increased equality of access to employment opportunities and increased employment
7.5.5 and 7.7.1 Expansion of local employer 'grow your own' schemes that could provide a solution to some of the skills gaps experienced in the City for certain professions.	+ Development of a healthy labour market linked to the needs of the economy, with increased employment
Establish a Learning Charter and workplace learning awards programme	+ Development of a healthy labour market
7.6.4 and 7.7.1 Building management and leadership capacity within organisations in Carlisle; develop range of management & leadership programmes	+ Development of a healthy labour market
7.6.3 and 7.7.1 Ensuring there are progression pathways for people to follow, linked to priority growth areas, and development of innovative ways of retaining graduates.	+ Development of a healthy labour market linked to the needs of the economy, with increased employment
7.10.1 Initiatives to support social enterprise	+ Increased employment and community cohesion
7.10.1 Initiatives to support environmental	+ Protection of the environment

management	
7.9.4 Support innovation and knowledge transfer by providing access to research and development expertise of the University of Cumbria	+ Increased business and employment opportunities

### 6.3. Connections

Project/Proposal	Potential Effects (+ Positive, X negative)
8.5 Support for developing the market for scheduled air services	X Increased carbon emissions resulting from more flights
8.5 Publication and programme of lobbying based on 'Routes to a prosperous Cumbria' produced by Cumbria CC	+ Increased numbers of tourists and economic activity
8.5 Promotion of Tourism opportunities arising from the development of Carlisle Airport	+ Increased numbers of tourists and economic activity
8.5 Exploitation the airport as a tool in changing the perception of Carlisle as a location for investment [see 'Place' chapter on Promoting Carlisle]	+ Increased investment and economic activity
8.7.1 Maintain close links with the Highways Agency and the DfT to secure improvements to A69	+ Increased safety and accessibility to and from Carlisle, and reduced traffic congestion  X Extra capacity for cars could increase dependency and use of cars.
8.7.2 Improvements to service levels, capacity, infrastructure and facilities on the rail lines feeding into Carlisle	+ Increased rail patronage, reduced traffic congestion, reduced carbon emission by cars
8.9.1 and Table C2 Improve bus usage, facilities and priority measures such as through s106 agreements	+ Increased bus usage and less car dependency
Table C2 Walking and cycling initiatives	+ Encourage reduced car dependency, reduced carbon emissions and healthier lifestyles
Table PE3: Work with businesses to reduce carbon emissions and be more aware of their Carbon Footprint by:  Providing environmental business advice	

<p>covering preparing and implementing an environmental policy and continuous improvement, with a focus on reducing the Carbon Dioxide emissions</p> <p>To work with businesses to benchmark their dioxide emissions and reduce these through a range of options including exploring new technologies</p>	<p>+ More environmentally friendly business practice with more efficient use of natural resources</p> <p>+ Reduced carbon emissions from local businesses</p>
<p>8.1.3 Effectively integrate land use proposals and transport planning</p>	<p>+ Help to plan and facilitate use of more sustainable modes of transport</p>
<p>8.1.4 Target growth at areas that can be effectively served by public transport, that provide good accessibility to jobs goods and services on foot by cycle and will require demand for travel by private car to be suppressed</p>	<p>+ Promotes sustainable development based on sustainable modes of transport.</p>
<p>8.9.2 Development and implementation of a Parking Strategy – potential risk for increased car dependency depending on the aims of the Strategy and how it is implemented.</p>	<p>? Ensure that the Parking Strategy is integrated with and supports the Economic Development Strategy actions related to increased use of sustainable forms of transport and reduced greenhouse emissions.</p> <p>Consideration should be given to parking restraint measure such as limited parking combined with provision of public transport access routes, to encourage travel mode shift, and to reduce car use and greenhouse emissions.</p>